



## U.S. Department of Justice

United States Attorney  
Southern District of New York

**MEMO ENDORSED**

The Jacob K. Javits Federal Building  
26 Federal Plaza, 37th Floor  
New York, New York 10278

November 22, 2024

**BY ECF**

Honorable Valerie E. Caproni  
United States District Judge  
Southern District of New York  
New York, New York 10007

USDC SDNY  
DOCUMENT  
ELECTRONICALLY FILED  
DOC #: \_\_\_\_\_  
DATE FILED: 11/26/24

**Re: *United States v. Estalin Batista*, 19 Cr. 308 (VEC)**

Dear Judge Caproni:

The Government respectfully requests that the Court enter the enclosed proposed order authorizing the United States Probation Office to release to this Office a copy of the defendant's probation file, including all records of communications and supervising activity, in anticipation of a violation of supervised release hearing, so that the Government may prepare for the hearing and comply with its obligations under the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure; *Brady v. Maryland*, 373 U.S. 83 (1963); *United States v. Giglio*, 405 U.S. 763 (1972), and its progeny; and Title 18, United States Code, Section 3500. Specifically, the Government respectfully requests access to all documents and materials in the possession of the Probation Office that underly the specifications in the Violation Report dated August 21, 2024, including but not limited to the Probation Office's chronological notes, results of drug tests, treatment reports, location monitoring notifications, and communications with the defendant and/or the defendant's family members.

A proposed Order is enclosed for the Court's consideration. Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Respectfully submitted,

DAMIAN WILLIAMS  
United States Attorney

By:

Adam S. Hobson  
Lauren E. Phillips  
Assistant United States Attorney  
(212) 637-2484 / 2237

Application DENIED without prejudice. Mr. Batista has been on supervised release since April 8, 2021, and the government's proposed order seeking Mr. Batista's entire case file is far too broad and seeks materials that are irrelevant to the violation specification outlined in the August 21, 2024 report. The government is permitted to make another, more tailored application for the materials that are pertinent to the violation specification that is the subject of the upcoming VOSR hearing.

SO ORDERED.

11/26/24

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Valerie Caproni", is written over the typed name.

HON. VALERIE CAPRONI  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE